
H-France Review Vol. 16 (February 2016), No. 30

Daisy Delogu, Emma Cayley, and Joan E. McRae, eds. *A Companion to Alain Chartier (c. 1385-1430): Father of French Eloquence*. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2015. xiii + 374 pp. Figures, bibliography, and index. \$219.00 U.S. (hb). ISBN 978-90-04-27218-7; \$219.00 U.S. (eb). ISBN 978-90-04-29014-3.

Review by Julie Singer, Washington University in St. Louis.

A Companion to Alain Chartier is a recent addition to Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition, a series targeted toward advanced students and non-specialists that seeks to provide "full balanced accounts at an advanced level, as well as synthesis of debate and the state of scholarship" on topics in medieval and early modern European intellectual and religious history.[1] *A Companion to Alain Chartier* does all of this and more. It offers an excellent introduction to the literary works and networks of Alain Chartier, with a few added delights for the specialist, too.

The volume consists of a brief introduction followed by fourteen essays grouped into four parts: Chartier in his Cultural, Literary, and Material Context; Approaches to Chartier; Textual Communities; and Charterian Influence. The structure is smooth and logically coherent, though it might have been more helpful to include Olivia Robinson's overview of the manuscript and print transmission of Chartier's works in part one. The editors strike a fine balance between two types of essay: some present a comprehensive overview of their subject, while others take a more narrowly conceived critical approach to one or more texts. In the former category, James Laidlaw's rundown of Chartier's life and works delivers a clear introduction (or refresher) for the non-specialist, while the essays on material/publication history (Camille Serchuk on illuminated manuscripts and Robinson on the manuscript and early print tradition) provide a practical, much-needed scholarly resource. Serchuk, in particular, offers an essential supplement to Patricia Gathercole's earlier study of the topic.[2] Joan McRae and Ashby Kinch contribute cogent reviews of the debate on the *Belle Dame sans mercy* and on Chartier's influence on late medieval European writers, respectively. These five essays embody the spirit of the "companion," handbook writing at its best. The less broadly conceived essays, too, are consistently solid in quality, and many of them represent the very best in new Chartier scholarship. The piece by Emma Cayley and Hanno Wijsman stands out, with its novel art historical approach to the question of Chartier's Latin and French oeuvre. Andrea Tarnowski's chapter on Chartier's sources holds its own as a reading of a few works, though it left this reviewer hungry for a more comprehensive study of Chartier's sources (including the sources of his Latin works). Other highlights include Daisy Delogu's work on gender and emotion and Adrian Armstrong's study of Chartier and the Rhétoriciens.

A Companion to Alain Chartier's focus and organization highlight resonances between the essays—though the comparisons thus invited are not altogether flattering to its very few weaker chapters. The internal cohesion within each of the Companion's four parts tends to magnify some repetition between essays, repetition that is almost inevitable in a volume of this type. This effect is most striking in the sequence of four consecutive essays devoted at least partly to Chartier's political engagement: those by Delogu, Craig Taylor, Jean-Claude Mühlethaler, and Deborah McGrady. (Indeed, given this thematic concentration, the catch-all section title "Approaches to Chartier" might easily have been replaced with a more specifically politically-oriented heading.) By the time the reader reaches Mühlethaler's rather shallow (and very French) overview, it feels stale and its contribution to the volume is diminished.

Later, in part four, Marta Marfany's very interesting study of Catalan imitators of Chartier is followed immediately by Kinch's essay, which covers much of the same ground (often citing Marfany) in its section on Catalan writers. As nice as Marfany's chapter is, it seems a bit out of place in *A Companion to Alain Chartier*--why does Charterian influence on Catalan literature rate its own chapter, while other and arguably more important literary traditions, like English, do not? For a handbook-style volume, Kinch's piece is probably sufficient. Likewise, the last two articles, those by Armstrong and by Florence Bouchet, tread rather similar territory to one another. While Bouchet promises to discuss Chartier's influence in the two centuries following his death, she ends up talking primarily about the Rhétoriqueurs, whom Armstrong had just treated in deeper and more engaging fashion. If Chartier remains present as a major influence in French letters after the first third of the sixteenth century, Bouchet's essay does not adequately communicate that fact; if he does not, then, given the presence of Armstrong's first-rate contribution to the volume, Bouchet's chapter was not needed at all. These instances of repetition do not detract from the volume's consistently high quality; rather, they highlight its coherence and its completeness as a guide to Chartier and to Chartier studies.

In sum, *A Companion to Alain Chartier* is a thoughtfully compiled volume that furnishes a helpful introduction for students and for non-specialist scholars, as well as some useful resources for researchers who are more deeply engaged with Chartier. Though the specialist may find it lacking in a few very minor areas--this reviewer would have preferred a fuller bibliography of secondary sources, rather than an eight-page selected bibliography, as well as a more complete consideration of Chartier's sources--*A Companion to Alain Chartier* is the best existing point of entry into Chartier studies. It is a must-read for Chartier's legions of adoring fans.

LIST OF ESSAYS

Daisy Delogu, Joan E. McRae, and Emma Cayley, "Introduction"

James C. Laidlaw, "Alain Chartier: A Historical and Biographical Overview"

Andrea Tarnowski, "Alain Chartier's Singularity, or How Sources Make an Author"

Emma Cayley and Hanno Wijsman, "The Bilingual Chartier: Authorial Duality and Identity in the French and Latin *Oeuvre* of Alain Chartier"

Camille Serchuk, "The Illuminated Manuscripts of the Works of Alain Chartier"

Daisy Delogu, "Performance and Polemic: Gender and Emotion in the Works of Alain Chartier"

Craig Taylor, "Alain Chartier and Chivalry: Debating Knighthood in the Context of the Hundred Years War"

Jean-Claude Mühlethaler, "Alain Chartier, Political Writer"

Deborah McGrady, "'Que tous se rallient': Alain Chartier, Pierre de Nesson, and the Poetics of Peace"

Joan E. McRae, "A Community of Readers: The Quarrel of the *Belle Dame sans mercy*"

Olivia Robinson, "Alain Chartier: The Manuscript and Print Tradition"

Marta Marfany, "Alain Chartier and Medieval Catalan Literature"

Ashby Kinch, "Chartier's European Influence"

Adrian Armstrong, "Alain Chartier and the *Rhétoriciens*"

Florence Bouchet, "A Good Carter as Guide: Imitating Alain Chartier (15th Century-Early 17th Century)"

NOTES

[1] <http://www.brill.com/cn/publications/brills-companions-christian-tradition>, consulted 11/25/2015

[2] Patricia Gathercole, "Illuminations on the Manuscripts of Alain Chartier," *Studi Francesi* 20 (1976): 504-10.

Julie Singer
Washington University in St. Louis
jesinger@wustl.edu

Copyright © 2015 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for edistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/ republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of H-France Review nor re-publication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on H-France Review are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172