
H-France Review Vol. 17 (December 2017), No. 223

Georges Vigarello, ed., *De l'Antiquité aux Lumières*, vol. 1 of *Histoire des émotions*, Alain Corbin, Jean-Jacques Courtine, and Georges Vigarello, eds. Paris: Seuil, 2016. 549 pp., Figures, notes, bibliography, and index. €39.90 (hb). ISBN 9-782021-177299.

Alain Corbin, ed., *Des Lumières à la fin du XIXe siècle*, vol. 2 of *Histoire des émotions*, Alain Corbin, Jean-Jacques Courtine, and Georges Vigarello, eds. Paris: Seuil, 2016. 477 pp. Figures, notes, bibliography, and index. €39.90 (hb). ISBN 9-782021-177367.

Review by Susan Broomhall, The University of Western Australia.

These two volumes form a triad in two senses. They are the first two volumes in a three-part collection on emotions, with the third volume covering the end of the nineteenth century to the present and edited by Jean-Jacques Courtine, published in October 2017. The collection also emerges as the third multi-author, multi-volume, illustrated work published by this editorial team, after histories of the body and virility.[1] The editors situate the present work as a further *longue durée* study, framed by an emotional turn whose antecedents include Lucien Febvre, Jean Delumeau, and Peter N. and Carol Z. Stearns, the history of mentalities, gender and cultural studies, and the new emotions-focused analyses of the past ten years, including those by Thomas Dixon, Ute Frevert, Barbara Rosenwein, William M. Reddy, Eva Illouz, Piroska Nagy, and Damien Boquet.[2] The editors aim to contribute to this scholarship by tracing the presence and impact of emotions in history as well as how emotions shape sensibilities and create the particular cultural tones of societies in times past.

The scholarly reader might crave a little more from the general introduction. There is a short reflection towards its end on the complicated history of the central word of this series, *émotions*, and the editors connect the history of *émotions* to a gradual construction of psychic space in the western mind. This understanding, the editors suggest, requires a degree of methodological innovation: “non plus d'en tenir à ce que font les acteurs, ou même à ce qu'ils s'imaginent ou se représentent, mais aller résolument au plus près de ce qu'ils éprouvent” (p. 11). This last line of the introduction leaves weighty questions unanswered, especially in terms of how a history that aims to understand *émotions* in distinct social and cultural environments should look beyond, or through, the extant written, visual, and material records.

Furthermore, there is no discussion here about the decisions regarding the date range of each volume. Volume one covers the enormous chronological territory of antiquity to the Enlightenment while volume two analyses the period from the Enlightenment to the end of the nineteenth century. Although the dates of the Enlightenment give considerable flexibility of interpretation to authors, it has the consequence of splitting much eighteenth-century content across two volumes as well as missing an opportunity to consider the Enlightenment in depth as a cultural idea of significance to emotional expression. Still, a split must occur between the volumes somewhere and what it does enable is new consideration of the chronological stages of development and practice of emotions. It would have been rewarding, therefore, to learn more of the editors' thoughts about how historical eras might relate to,

cause, or reflect changing ideas about *émotions*, especially in the light of an increasing number of collections and monographs that survey broadly from antiquity to the nineteenth century, and especially cross the medieval to early modern “divide.” This decision also gives volume one much more conceptual and concrete work to do than volume two, since it covers a far longer and more disparate time period. Volume two, by contrast, presents as a more internally coherent collection, with essays communicating and building on findings elsewhere in the book. Together, these divisions might well give the impression to readers that there is less to say about classical and medieval feelings, that they are harder for scholars to analyze, or that perhaps their emotional range was less sophisticated and of less interest to study. None of these assumptions would be correct and a great deal of recent literature shows how the rich and varied visual, musical and material as well as textual sources of these periods can help us to explore their complex emotional worlds.

Additionally, in volume one, the geographic range moves broadly from the Mediterranean in “Antiquity” to Western Europe in the “Middle Ages” and “Modern Age,” with a number of studies bringing forth new analyses of French material in particular. In volume two, the field narrows considerably to French experiences, although a few authors reference other contemporary environments, most often in British, German, and U.S. examples. This too contributes to volume two’s sense of coherence and renders volume one encyclopedic in feel. These differences may also be a product and reflection of the authorship patterns of each volume. The authors of volume one’s twenty-four chapters are internationally diverse, while the sixteen essays of volume two are predominantly written by those within the French academy. Some authors are leading contributors to the scholarship of the history of emotions, notably Boquet, Nagy, and Rosenwein, while others are coming to consideration of this field from other scholarly contexts. This produces a wide variety of presentation styles. Some contributions provide detailed case studies, while others survey a broad range of examples. Not all authors give the same attention to questions of terminology and concepts or to clear presentation of their methods and sources. The language of *émotions* is diverse, not only across Latin and vernacular European examples, but also as it is used analytically, as *émoi*, *sensibilité*, *affektive*, *sentimental*, *émotionnel*, and many more, choices that are not always explicitly articulated in the individual chapters. Taken as a whole, however, the essays offer accessible presentations of their research and much valuable material to engage scholars and a broader public with this field.

Georges Vigarello has the challenging task of editing the first volume. An explicit analysis by the editor of how historical emotions can be understood through the chosen chronological demarcations would have been welcome, but Vigarello’s views emerge through his editorial interventions and as author of four chapters within this volume. There is a certain indebtedness for many authors in this volume to the civilizing theses of Elias and Huizinga, including its editor.[3] This places a tension at the heart of the volume, for a number of authors strongly argue against a notion of an irrational Middle Ages driven by unregulated emotions, including Rosenwein, Boquet, and perhaps especially, Nagy, whose chapter title, “L’émotion au Moyen Âge: un âge de raison,” flags a critique of such ideas. Moreover, Vigarello’s insistence on a thesis of change across these chronological divisions elides evident similarities and continuities in emotional practice and experience.

A first section on antiquity includes two broad-ranging chapters on the Greeks and the Romans by Maurice Sartre and Anne Vial-Logeay, respectively. Sartre usefully considers advances in the scholarship of this field, not least the significant work of Angelos Chaniotis, and the potential sources accessible to emotions analysis.[4] He highlights ancient Greek modes of considering emotions, including their lack of precise distinction between immediate emotion experiences and longer-held feeling states, as well as the social and gender contexts that legitimated particular emotions, such as anger, for some but not others. Sartre demonstrates the importance of emotions in public life, from religious ceremony and funeral orations to theatre, civic adhesion, and popular persuasion, and within the domestic and familial sphere, concluding that emotions were vital to the organization of society as a whole. Anne Vial-Logeay looks particularly to the significance of emotion within Roman civic

experiences, whilst acknowledging the lack of unity about these sensations for contemporary authors. She explores the contrasting pull of stoicism's emotional control and theatrical, populist emotional rhetoric in public life in shaping the success of politicians as well as facilitating a sense of community membership to the *urbs*. This assumed distinctive emotional capacities for the populous and civic elite.

Although only two chapters consider the ancient world directly, the continuing presence of classical ideas and practices is evident in the second section, "Middle Ages." Vigarello provides a brief introduction in which he foregrounds violence as a shaping force for this age, from the time of the barbarians through continuing war to knightly culture. This dynamic, he argues, wrestled with the new emotional orientation of Christianity after the fifth and sixth centuries, and its presentation of hope, compassion, familial bonding and love. These conflicting tendencies, he suggests, formed "une instabilité psychologique," "de brusques accès de colère," and flagellants' "fièvre": "Ce qui permet d'ailleurs de mieux comprendre, par contraste, l'invention de la civilité par la société moderne: un type de contrôle sur soi inédit, plus structuré, plus intériorisé, sinon plus théorisé" (p. 91).

In his analysis of "the barbarians" from the fourth to the sixth centuries, however, Bruno Dumézil offers an alternative to the long dominant historiography guided by a single emotion, fear, generated in large part by late Roman sources. He considers a wide range of new source types, coins and burial finds among them, which shed light not only on the adaptation of classical models in changing circumstances but also on the importance of emotional practices as part of the social rules of this society. These include systems of dispute (anger, shame, and dishonor) resolution and the role of kings in modeling anger but also willingness to be appeased and open to dialogue. Dumézil also shows how the shift to Christianity opened up a new range of emotions and emotional possibilities seen through the behavior of saints and of God. This latter thread is pursued in Barbara H. Rosenwein's essay that presents research from her recent monograph on the emotional pluralism of the Middle Ages and its use of two different emotions traditions—stoic and Augustinian—and understandings of the relationship between deadly sins and emotions as vices.^[5] She explores three distinct emotional communities, highlighting how Gregory of Tours and Venantius Fortunatus forged a new emotional style with a strong familial focus and emphasis on bonds of love, how the sixth-century Neustrian court came to define its identity through distinctive use of feeling words, and, finally, the differing emotional formulations in Alcuin's therapeutic treatise that considered the emotions of pastoral interactions with the laity and as vices and virtues.

Claude Thomasset and Vigarello combine forces in the following chapter to mine the medieval archeology of the terms "esmouvoir" and "esmouvement." They argue that these were primarily conceptualized as material and implying a sense of causality; that is, affect was initiatory, it moved and made action. By the fourteenth century, however, although a sense of movement remained in the term, its meaning had shifted toward the abstract, separated from distinct parts of the body such as humors, flesh, and organs such as the heart. Piroska Nagy's powerful essay debunks any idea of the Middle Ages as an impulsive period (a theme also taken up strongly by Boquet and Lett) and charts a detailed historiography of assumptions about this period from Huizinga, Febvre, Elias, and Freud. Nagy emphasizes the large medieval palette for expressing and describing emotional states, none of which uses the word emotion, and much of which was informed by religious ideas. The sense of movement and causation here concerns movement of the soul and terms such as *affectio*, *affectus*, and then passion take center stage as reflecting both the Passion and the passionate Christian subject. With material from the fourth century on, this essay's chronology overlaps with pieces both before and after and provides a strong historical and methodological anchor grounded in recent emotions research.

Thomasset's second contribution offers an encyclopedic presentation of references to emotions in "quotidien" and medical sources. Whether the fine-grained feeling expressions of the literature of *chansons de geste* is an everyday source, or a source for everyday experience, might be questionable but in doing so, the essay provides coverage of an important aspect of medieval culture. Thomasset considers emotional contrariness at the heart of *chansons* (termed here "scènes simples et directes" (p. 142)), which

drives individuals to a variety of kinds of loss of consciousness; that is, they are moved in physical ways (from a blush to fainting) by a tumult of strong emotions. He then analyses the theoretical perspective of contemporary medicine in nuancing such understandings of the role of the emotions in and on the body, through the work of William of Conches and Bernard de Gordon, which suggests a powerful connection between humors, emotions, personality and, increasingly, physiognomy.

Damien Boquet provides another significant contribution, arguing that “le Christianisme médiéval a été une religion du salut par les passions” (p. 153). He interprets monasteries as affective communities and laboratories of passions in the model of the Passion. These emotional practices then moved beyond the enclosed environment and could be found in the emphasis within saintly and mystical experiences on love and tears as devotion to Christ’s humanity in the Passion as an active, bodily form of emotional Christianity. By the end of the period, pastoral texts turned to educate the laity and consider emotions of and for the masses. Boquet contends that fear and shame were central in these processes, in which the manipulation of emotion states operated in apocalyptic visions designed to generate crowd fervor and frenzy, and translated into bodily practices such as flagellation and even massacres.

Turning to the domestic realm, Didier Lett analyses emotional relations between husband and wife, parents and children as well as the wider familial grouping, emphasizing the varied nature and dynamism of affective bonds generated in these contexts. He critiques the view that medieval people acted instinctively, demonstrating the deliberated models of family life, particularly religious ones, with which they were presented. Lett argues that honor also played a key role as a matrix for emotional roles and expressions within the family. Laurent Smagghe concludes this section with an assessment of the use of political emotions in princely courts, and the vitality of symbolic communication through a grammar of gestures, behavior and signs. Smagghe’s analysis of the importance of the prince’s face and heart to his rule, his legitimate use of anger and tears as political rhetoric, and women as mediating and appeasing forces bear similarities with the earlier analysis of Dumézil and again insist upon the highly structured, stylized and considered nature of emotional performance in the Middle Ages.

In the “Modern Age,” Vigarello senses a change to the types of fear that predominated in the Middle Ages and proposes that “la raison gagne insensiblement sur l’émotion” (p. 217). Certainly, the evidence he and the authors of this section present suggests a displacement of fear to new sites, and new types and objects of fear; however, that these reflect a waning influence of emotion over reason seems less clear.

Vigarello considers the emergence of the word *émotion* in this era, tracing its shift from a sense of movement in the physical body to a more dematerialized experience in works by Descartes, Sévigné, Corneille, Rochefoucauld, and Pascal. Uncoupled from the body, it interacted with an existing language of the soul and a newer vocabulary of the spirit and suggests, Vigarello contends, a movement in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century texts towards an interiorization of “l’affect” (p. 224). This textual focus complements the essay by Lawrence Kritzman that follows, concerning affective rhetoric in the work of Montaigne. Kritzman opens with some broad claims, including that Montaigne “introduit la modernité en donnant à la passion une place aussi nouvelle que nuancée” (p. 225). This hinges substantially on what is meant by modernity, a term that is never clarified by the editor or most of the authors who use it. Montaigne himself is notoriously ambiguous about generalizing, but, whether it be the cruelty of the masses, their fear of death or his own special friendship with La Boétie, Kritzman shows patterns to his thinking about emotions that distinguish between his self, its emotional responses, imagination and personal bodily experiences, and those of others.

In the next chapter, Vigarello studies what he sees as a structuring of emotional conceptualization during this period. It might be argued that it is not so much that “l’univers affectif se ‘structure’” (p. 241), as that the emotion terms and theorization of this era become more recognizable to modern readers. Vigarello highlights the changing relationship of these terms to the body, for as the psychic begins to

take precedence, new hydraulic and mechanical models reflective of contemporary technologies are utilized in explanatory frameworks and new hierarchies emerge about the duration and intensity of different passion states. Vigarello thus concludes that modernity transforms the “paysage traditionnel de l’affect” (p. 252) but did emotions also influence it, as Kritzman argues? What is the relationship between emotions and modernity? Peter N. Stearns, for one, has recently argued for modernity’s analytical power to guide study of historical emotions.[6]

Evolving from Elias’s civilizing process thesis, Montandon’s argument is that the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries witnessed the emergence of a new regulating motor for the emotions, the self, which he develops through a study of literary and philosophical texts by Castiglione, Erasmus, Descartes, and Corneille. Citing Huizinga and Jérôme Thomas [7], Montandon claims the penchant for violent acts and “une certaine instabilité psychologique” (p. 256) that characterized medieval individuals were altered through new efforts to create non-violent interactions. These included through confraternities within urban environments, an explosion of printed conduct texts at this period, and the practices of the courtly realm, including its dance forms, for mastery of a self that projected emotional restraint and modesty. Seemingly contrasting this new reserve were the mystical experiences of the soul in which an exuberant corporeal response suggested one’s readiness to unite with God. Sophie Houdard outlines in the next chapter how suffering and pleasure were central to this communion, in which contemplative literature primed readers for a relationship with the divine in which the self would be effaced in the union with God. Interiority was thus a complicated concept, since violent emotions were both a sign of this communion, yet suggested the intimate experience of an individual self. After the first third of the seventeenth century, however, Houdard argues that dramatic bodily expression became increasingly suspect as a sign of the presence of God.

Christian Jouhaud analyses other intense emotions as politically and socially coded expressions. To educated onlookers such as Pierre de l’Estoile and Pierre Charron, there were distinctions between the irrational public, whose feeling expressions were often considered irrational and pathologized, rather than politically meaningful. Yet Jouhaud argues that such conclusions were themselves embedded in emotional politics—that of the fear of their elite authors about the potential threat of a feeling mob. Close study of individual episodes highlights this “économie passionnelle complexe” (p. 301) and the distinct roles of women, men and children in the theatrical ceremonial politics of mercy and contrition between king and his subjects. The next contribution offers analysis of a specific emotional state, honor, that connects in useful ways to Lett’s earlier essay on the family understood as a socio-political entity. Hervé Drévilion explores honor as social capital that structured the identity of individuals and group formations from the family to guilds, and was part of an individual self but one subject to, and part of, a wider community. Across a range of forms from dueling, the recognition of female honor (albeit something to be defended by men), to responses to insults and challenges to rank in ritualized ceremony, Drévilion charts an exacerbation in the emotional charge in such behaviors that nourished a cycle of revenge and a willingness to die, and which led to establishment of institutional sites for regulating honor infractions. A similar thematic approach is taken in Maurice Daumas’s chapter on the relationship between particular forms of love and friendship. The latter was understood as between equals who participated in ritual acts of exchange such as gifts and armed assistance that demanded and assumed a liberty of action for both parties to choose the other, one that initially excluded male-female friendship and that between women. This elite masculine culture (or perhaps cult) was distinct from marriage, which prioritized female emotions of wifely devotion and maternal love and where male passion for a wife was considered disorderly. Over the seventeenth century, however, these values began to shift, Daumas argues, as the feminized court, salon culture, and role models such as Madame de Pompadour created mixed-sex environments in which a new perception of women emerged as partners worthy of conjugal friendship and perhaps even love.

Yves Hersant innovates analysis of melancholy by considering it not as an emotion but as having great emotional power and range, which has had both contemporaries and historians struggling to capture

this wide-ranging phenomenon. Certainly, melancholy has been of strong recent interest as studies by Gowland and Sullivan suggest.[8] Hersant's examination of the core body of literature developed between the fifteenth and eighteenth centuries charts the evolution of explanatory models from the classically influenced notion of melancholy as a child of Saturn through to the influence of the devil at the time of the Reformation. By the seventeenth century, melancholic emotions were not only for individuals but could afflict professional bodies such as artists, and then, women and national cohorts for whom it evolved into new feeling behaviors and distinctive vocabularies of experience. In the following essay, Vigarello examines understandings of emotion as they apply to law, in particular to violent crimes. He argues that the significance of a victim's feelings, pain or suffering was determined principally by their social class. The restitution of honor, therefore, in a rape case was a social act rather than a psychological one. However, developing idea of compassion by the eighteenth century allowed for progressive recognition of a victim's voice and individual experience.

Christian Biet takes an expansive view of emotions in the theatre to consider the social performance of emotions of the audience, with each other and with those on stage. He examines *arrêts* and *ordonnances* that attempted to regulate conduct in the theatre space, as well as theoretical texts and their application by contemporary dramatists. These considered the multiple ways in which audiences could engage with performers—via the emotional representations of declarative statements and gestures and as a connection to the character performed—in shared understandings of emotions and concerns about provoking passion states too forcefully in audiences. Gilles Cantagrel traces a rise of more intensely personal registers of music such as the madrigal and works designed to be performed by soloists, as theorists debated here too how music and bodily movement, note and instrument choices, tone and harmonies, scales and dissonances, rhythm and meter, could and should excite the passions in listeners. Classical models remained significant but Cantagrel also points to new frameworks developed in the light of music's perceived importance for Lutheran and Counter-Reformation practices in guiding the faithful to Christ.

Martial Guéron continues the focus of this sequence of chapters on artistic forms, with exploration of theorists' debates about the expression of emotion in art during the seventeenth century. Long-held notions about emotions reflected in physiognomy and humoral theory were melded with new rational and mechanistic ideas emerging from Descartes and physician Marin Cureau de la Chambre, exemplified in Charles Le Brun's syncretic approach. Distinctions in emotional expression through the face and body were to be made between primitive and composed passions, and between those of different classes. As with other artistic forms, there was also considerable debate about the responsibilities of art in terms of provoking emotional states in viewers and educating them towards a more refined affective range. Colin Jones concludes volume one with a wide-ranging piece assessing the development of the smile from a sign of laughter or ambiguous aggression to pleasure, ideas developed more fully in his monograph.[9] He argues that elite attention to control of facial emotional expression and the reform of manners rendered open-mouth smiling undesirable, if not a sign of madness. However, by the early eighteenth century, sentimental discourse, as developed in novels, and improved dental hygiene set the scene for change that was reflected in Elisabeth Vigée-Lebrun's landmark self-portrait with her daughter, in which she presents a captivating smile of maternal affection.

Volume two's essays are grouped into two period divisions; from 1730 to the Revolution, and then the aftermath of the Revolution to the 1880s. These divisions clearly signal the volume's focus on a French narrative. This narrower focus reveals much new information to enhance further history of emotions work, and allows readers a growing, deeper sense of emotional experiences and conceptualization in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century France. In the first chapter, Michel Delon analyses changing literary notions of emotions as physical sensations but also as moral determinations and ways of knowing that were increasingly uncoupled from the body. His investigation into contemporary attention to the senses explores the valorization of minimal sensations as intense, often erotic, emotional experiences. Corbin's contribution then opens a cluster of essays concerned with emotions and the

natural world. He draws upon diaries, art, and literature to analyze individuals' feelings, moods, and emotional tones borne of confrontation with nature, from meteorological phenomena to dramatic landscapes that were slowly becoming desacralized. Corbin argues that the depiction of weather in such sources became a projection and language of the self of particular intensity in the first half of the nineteenth century. Serge Briffaud's contribution continues this focus, exploring how mountains and coasts became, for the elite, journeys of self-discovery and sites of replenishment of the self in the latter half of the eighteenth century. For increasingly urbanized populations, these retreats were seen to re-order emotional experiences, as well as heal the physical body. These new emotional connections with nature were also reflected in art and music that equally aimed to engage directly with sensations produced by artists' engagement with nature rather than through conventional codes of representation. Anouchka Vasak analyzes how collective feeling about weather and its consequences were understood by contemporaries and historians to have consequences in social and political action, both as intense passions and longer-term feelings of sadness and anxiety. This was particularly the case towards the end of the eighteenth century when a series of unfavorable weather events produced unpredictable agricultural conditions and increased scientific attention to observation and understanding of meteorological phenomena.

Guillaume Mazeau then embarks on an enormous, encyclopedic survey of political emotions in the Revolution in which they served variously, depending on one's persuasion, as signs of an unstable and degenerate populace, as natural modes of communication, or as a true source of knowledge. This fine-grained presentation works through a typology of emotions and their political consequences in a structure that re-presents the Revolution through different, and perhaps unexpected, emotional lenses, including suffering, hatred, shock, terror, calm, friendship, love, and grief. It is an exhausting journey, just as Mazeau depicts the post-Revolutionary survivors who hoped the Bourbon restoration of 1814-15 would present an opportunity for rest and recovery after the emotional turmoil of revolutionary passions. In the face of this wealth of information it seems churlish to ask for more, but it would have been interesting to have a sense of Mazeau's theoretical position and engagement with other scholars such as Reddy and Nicole Eustace working on emotions in contemporary revolutionary contexts. [10]

Anne Carol's essay on the changing forms of corporal punishment begins the second section of this volume. Her analysis responds to Elias's narrative in exploring why punitive regimes from the eighteenth century onwards saw new, more humane, forms and led to abolition of capital punishment in a number of European countries, but her interest is primarily in the emotions that drove such changes. These reflected concerns to alleviate suffering and shame, to avoid potential emotional frailties in executioners, and to educate spectators and avoid them pitying the perpetrator.

Judith Lyon-Caen examines literature and journals that practiced a particular "grammaire de l'émotion" (p. 169). She argues that the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries saw the rise of an intense pedagogy in exploration of individual feelings and their expression. This emerged from a longer tradition of meditative, diarized communion with God in works surveilled by elders, as well as a new literature that primed readers to these modes of expression, guiding young women in particular on the nature of relationships with others, and on the trajectory of strong emotions such as love. Corbin's fascinating second chapter continues this focus on youth as he explores medical publications that sought to investigate the stages of puberty and the specifics of sexual desire. These postulated female puberty as a deeply troubling stage, both for women and the male authors whose fears about emotional female adolescents at risk of intense sexual experiences before marriage were evident in these texts. Corbin explores how their works sought to understand sexual arousal and orgasm in emotional terms and as more than animal or mechanical processes and accordingly, situates their warnings of the dangers of masturbation as a concern that it would blunt individuals' capacity for finer emotional experiences in socio-sexual relations. In the domestic sphere, such relations were then undergoing what Agnès Walch terms a "densification des émotions". She explores the growing idea from the eighteenth century of the family as an emotional refuge where partners and children provided emotional relief, in emotionally

heightened, domestically oriented activities such as Christmas. But whose refuge was it, she asks, for feelings and sexual desires could not be freely expressed here any more than elsewhere, and conformity to the views of the patriarch was expected.

Hervé Mazurel examines “enthousiasmes militaires” of almost contagious patriotic fervor and the “paroxysmes guerriers” (p. 227) in the violent conflicts that engulfed Europe from 1780 to 1815 before increasingly being displaced beyond the continent to colonial sites, corresponding with growing interest in war and battlefield emotions among scholars such as Kuijpers and van der Haven, and Downes, Lynch and O’Loughlin.^[11] Mazurel brings into focus both intimate and collective, generally masculine, experiences in analyzing their “charge émotionnelle” (p. 230). This includes the significance of war as a testing ground for masculinity and exploration of the wider world in which individuals encountered not only other peoples but also new and often challenging natural environments. Military service developed its “culture affective propre” (p. 256) that required (even if, as Mazurel shows, it did not achieve) specific forms of emotional control in the face of horrific sights, although these expectations varied for soldiers and officers, and in relation to conduct with foreign populations. Sylvain Venayre’s chapter on the emotions of hunting links conceptually to other studies in this volume on selves in confrontation with nature and the sublime, and men at war with themselves and others in foreign locales. In this quite new area of investigation, Venayre considers how hunting offered opportunities to live strong emotions in a pedagogy of masculinity that was not only for elite men, but also for readers, often adolescent boys, of popular literary accounts. Together, these offered an apprenticeship in powerful feelings of nature, war, nobility, virility, and death, and explored the emotional dimensions and meaning of savagery.

Corinne Legoy’s strong and insightful essay on “enthousiasmes de l’adhésion” (p. 277) analyses another relatively unexplored topic that complements the recent collection by Pernau et al.^[12] She argues persuasively that although enthusiasm may leave fewer traces than strong emotions such as anger, they were equally vital to nineteenth-century political processes and speak to larger questions about the intimate history of power. She charts the passions, romanticism, melancholy, and disillusionment with the French political program into the nineteenth century and its leaders’ attempt to construct a new model of educated and engaged citizenry and to recapture some revolutionary feelings and enthusiasm in collective emotional rituals and celebrations that were, literally, a moveable feast between royal and republican regimes. Emmanuel Fureix’s chapter forms the pendant pair with this essay, on the emotions of protest, in which he examines a range of popular, insurrectional and ritualized engagements with their own codes and gestures as well as those felt and lived at a distance through indignation and compassion. Drawing upon E.P. Thompson’s model of the moral economy for protests in the earlier period, Fureix sees a shift towards more institutionalized and autonomous protests over the century, a growing sense of fraternity across the continent on issues of shared concern, and a sentimentalization in melodramatic narrations of patriotic movements.

In a study of nineteenth-century Catholic religiosity, Guillaume Cuchet distinguishes between the Catholicism of the provinces and the cities; Brittany and Paris lived, for contemporaries, in two different religious ages. Cuchet explores fear as a tool in the re-education campaigns of the early century, which was slowly replaced by a gentler God of love and a growing Marian cult. Like Walch, Cuchet highlights the importance of familial affectivity, which created new regimes of emotion around death as children and partners were mourned with a new intensity but also in public expression of grief that crossed social boundaries. In the following chapter, Olivier Bara takes an expansive view of art forms of the stage that were proliferating during the nineteenth century, as theatrical representational styles for emotions emerged and new audiences demanded new forms from the melodramatic to the gore of true crime. The challenge of the performative arts’ role as pedagogy for the emotions of elite and populace, and how and what was to be conveyed, continued to be much debated. Increasingly, though, emotional experience was understood to be interiorized and individual, reflected in the shift in opera, for example, from separate, performed moments to a single flowing narrative appreciated by a silent audience, seated in a

darkened room, and oriented to the spot-lit stage—behaviors structured by the layout of new buildings such as Paris' Opéra Garnier.

Charles-François Mathis concludes the book with an essay that reinforces this volume's strong, overarching interest with emotions for and about nature. Mathis reflects upon the relationship of an increasingly urban population for a nature that they were both distant from as an everyday reality, yet increasingly in contact with in new ways through the development of train travel and photography. This shaped both a sense of alienation from nature and an intense longing for it reflected, for example, in romantic art, literature, and music. Access to free time, money, and trains also created new cohorts able to experience nature—women and tourists—whose capacity for appreciation was considered by male elites as less developed and thus so too their emotional engagement. As guidebooks could direct readers to privileged feeling sites, men in particular sought ever more remote landscapes and wilderness. Here they could commune in a seemingly personal and direct way with nature that provided them with opportunities to be challenged and tested emotionally.

Not all the findings of these essays are novel; many reflect trends and experiences documented elsewhere for this period. However, they bring much new research on French examples to bear on wider discussions in the history of emotions, even though few authors engage directly with this existing and growing literature, its conceptualizations and methodologies. Elias evidently remains influential for analysis of this period. The volume's strong interest in emotions of and with nature is profound and exciting, but leaves unexplored other topics of significance to the later eighteenth and nineteenth century, such as the rise of humanitarianism and compassion perhaps especially in the abolition of slavery or the recognition of protections for children and working animals, the challenges of crime in urbanizing environments, notions of trust and credit in the development of national and international economic and commercial systems, the colonial experiences of settlers and indigenous populations, and music, the sculptural arts, and architecture as dedicated topics for emotional investigation in their own right. Of course, one can always suggest more topics but some of these seem surprising oversights, just as in volume one's vast coverage, the absence of an essay that examines the emotional significance and power of medieval music, architecture, art or material culture, or a study of the Reformation or of the emotional experience of Protestants, even Huguenots, seems remarkable.

Both volumes provide color illustrations, typically three examples per essay, but, disappointingly, discussion of these images is generally not integrated into the authors' analyses. Such communication is not assisted by their placement in distinct blocks, away from the essays to which they pertain, and usually in the middle of a chapter. The editors make no claims to a singular approach through the volumes to the investigation of emotions and certainly the volumes contain a wide variety of approaches and analyses. This is both the strength and weakness of the collection as a scholarly endeavor, but it guarantees that all readers will find something to interest and engage them. As such, it represents an important addition to the history of emotions, one that, it is hoped, will stimulate other scholars to consider how emotions can form a useful analytical lens for their work.

LIST OF ESSAYS

Volume 1: *De l'Antiquité aux Lumières*

Alain Corbin, Jean-Jacques Courtine and Georges Vigarello, "Introduction générale"

Antiquité

Maurice Sartre, "Les Grecs"

Anne Vial-Logeay, "L'univers romain"

Moyen Âge

Bruno Dumézil, “Les barbares”

Barbara Rosenwein, “Le haut Moyen Âge”

Claude Thomasset and Georges Vigarello, “« Esmouvoir », « esmouvement » : Archéologie médiévale du mot « émotion »

Piroska Nagy, “L’émotion au Moyen Âge : un âge de raison”

Claude Thomasset, “Références quotidiennes, références médicales”

Damien Boquet, “Les passions du salut dans l’Occident médiéval”

Didier Lett, “Famille et relations émotionnelles”

Laurent Smagghe, “Les émotions politiques dans les cours princières au XIV^e-XV^e siècle”

Âge moderne

Georges Vigarello, “L’émergence du mot « émotion »”

Lawrence Kritzman, “Une rhétorique affective à la Renaissance : L’exemple de Montaigne”

Georges Vigarello, “Joie, tristesse, terreur... La mécanique classique des humeurs”

Alain Montandon, “L’invention d’une autosurveillance intime”

Sophie Houdard, “Affections de l’âme et émotions dans l’expérience mystique”

Christian Jouhaud, “L’effusion collective et le politique”

Hervé Drévilion, “L’honneur, de l’intime au politique”

Maurice Daumas, “Cœurs vaillants et cœurs tendres : L’amitié et l’amour à l’époque moderne”

Yves Hersant, “La mélancolie”

Georges Vigarello, “Ce qui dit la loi : abuser, violer”

Christian Biet, “Émotions expérimentales : théâtre et tragédie au XVII^e siècle français: Affects, sens, passions”

Gilles Cantagrel, “L’émotion musicale à l’âge baroque”

Martial Guéron, “Émotions, passions, affects : l’expression dans la théorie de l’art à l’âge classique”

Colin Jones, “Le sourire”

Volume 2. *Des Lumières à la fin du XIX^e siècle*

Alain Corbin, "Introduction"

De 1730 à l'Après-Révolution

Michel Delon, "L'éveil de l'âme sensible"

Alain Corbin, "Les émotions individuelles et le temps qu'il fait"

Serge Briffaud, "Face au spectacle de la nature"

Anouchka Vasak, "Grandes émotions météorologiques collectives"

Guillaume Mazeau, "Émotions politiques : la Révolution française"

Des Lendemain de la Révolution aux années 1880

Anne Carol, "Devant l'échafaud : du spectacle de la douleur au théâtre pédagogique"

Judith Lyon-Caen, "Le « je » et le baromètre de l'âme »

Alain Corbin, "Formes du désir et de la jouissance, déceptions et mal-être"

Agnès Walch, "De l'âme sensible à l'avènement scientifique des émotions : la densification des émotions dans la sphère privée"

Hervé Mazurel, "Enthousiasmes militaires et paroxysmes guerriers"

Sylvain Venayre, "Le temps des grandes chasses"

Corinne Legoy, "L'enthousiasme de l'adhésion : nouvelles formes d'émotions politiques"

Emmanuel Fureix, "Les émotions protestataires"

Guillaume Cuchet, "La rénovation de l'émotion religieuse"

Olivier Bara, "Les nouvelles émotions suscitées par les arts de la scène"

Charles-François Mathis, "« Comme un archet qui jouait sur mon âme » : l'individu face au paysage"

NOTES

[1] Alain Corbin, Jean-Jacques Courtine, and Georges Vigarello, eds., *Histoire du corps*, 3 vols. (Paris: Seuil, 2006) and Alain Corbin, Jean-Jacques Courtine, and Georges Vigarello, eds., *Histoire de la virilité*, 3 vols. (Paris: Seuil, 2011).

[2] Lucien Febvre, "La sensibilité et l'histoire: Comment reconstituer la vie affective d'autrefois?" *Annales d'histoire sociale* 3.1-2 (1941): 5-20; Jean Delumeau, *La Peur en Occident, XIVe-XVIIIe siècles: une cité assiégée* (Paris: Fayard, 1978); Peter N. Stearns and Carol Z. Stearns, "Emotionology: Clarifying the History of Emotions and Emotional Standards," *American Historical Review* 90 (1985): 813-36; Thomas Dixon, *From Passions to Emotions: The Creation of a Secular Psychological Category* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003); Ute Frevert, *Vergängliche Gefühle* (Göttingen: Wallstein, 2013); Barbara H.

Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2006); William M. Reddy, *The Navigation of Feeling: A Framework for the History of Emotions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001); Eva Illouz, *Les Sentiments du capitalisme* (Paris: Seuil, 2006); Piroska Nagy and Damien Boquet, *Sensible Moyen Âge: Une histoire des émotions dans l'Occident médiéval* (Paris: Seuil, 2015).

[3] Johan Huizinga, *The Waning of the Middle Ages*, trans. F. Hopman (London: Edward Arnold, 1924), originally published as *Herfsttij der Middeleeuwen: Studie over levens- en gedachtenvormen der veertiende en vijftiende eeuw in Frankrijk en de Nederlanden* (Haarlem: H. D. Tjeenk Willink, 1919); Norbert Elias, *The Civilizing Process*, vol. 1: *The History of Manners*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (Oxford: Blackwell, 1978) and *The Civilizing Process*, vol. 2: *State Formation and Civilization*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (Oxford: Blackwell, 1982), originally published as *Über den Prozeß der Zivilisation. Soziogenetische und psychogenetische Untersuchungen*, vol. 1, *Wandlungen des Verhaltens in den weltlichen Oberschichten des Abendlandes* and vol. 2, *Wandlungen der Gesellschaft. Entwurf einer Theorie der Zivilisation* (Basel: Falken, 1939).

[4] Angelos Chaniotis, ed., *Unveiling Emotions: Sources and Methods for the Study of Emotions in the Greek World* (Stuttgart: Steiner, 2012); Angelos Chaniotis and Pierre Ducrey, eds., *Unveiling Emotions II: Emotions in Greece and Rome: Texts, Images, Material Culture* (Stuttgart: Steiner, 2013).

[5] See chapters two and three of Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Generations of Feeling: A History of Emotions, 600-1700* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015).

[6] Peter N. Stearns, "Modern Patterns in Emotions History," in Susan J. Matt and Peter N. Stearns, eds., *Doing Emotion History* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2014), 17-40.

[7] Jérôme Thomas, *Corps violents, corps soumis : Le policement des mœurs à la fin du Moyen Âge* (Paris: Harmattan, 2003).

[8] Angus Gowland, *The Worlds of Renaissance Melancholy: Robert Burton in Context* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006); Erin Sullivan, *Beyond Melancholy: Sadness and Selfhood in Renaissance England* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016).

[9] Colin Jones, *The Smile Revolution: In Eighteenth-Century Paris* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014).

[10] William H. Reddy, *The Invisible Code: Honor and Sentiment in Postrevolutionary France, 1815-1848* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997); Nicole Eustace, *Passion is the Gale: Emotion, Power, and the Coming of the American Revolution* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2008) and *1812: War and the Passions of Patriotism* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012).

[11] See, for example, Stephanie Downes, Andrew Lynch, and Katrina O'Loughlin, eds., *Emotions and War: Medieval to Romantic Literature* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2015); Erika Kuijpers and Cornelis van der Haven, eds., *Battlefield Emotions 1500-1800: Practices, Experience, Imagination* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2016).

[12] Margrit Pernau, Helge Jordheim, Orit Bashkin, Christian Bailey, Oleg Benesch, Jan Ifversen, Mana Kia, Rochona Majumdar, Angelika C. Messner, Myoung-kyu Park, Emmanuelle Saada, Mohinder Singh, and Einar Wigen, *Civilizing Emotions. Concepts in Nineteenth Century Asia and Europe* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015).

The University of Western Australia
susan.broomhall@uwa.edu.au

Copyright © 2017 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for edistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of *H-France Review* nor republication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on *H-France Review* are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172